

House of Representatives commonwealth of pennsylvania harrisburg

August 26, 2021

Pennsylvania Independent Regulatory Review Commission 333 Market Street 14th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101



AUG 27 2021

Independent Regulatory Review Commission

Dear Commissioners:

We, the undersigned members of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, urge the Independent Regulatory Review Commission (IRRC) to disapprove final Environmental Quality Board (EQB) Regulation #7-559 (IRRC #3274), which would merge Pennsylvania into the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) over the objections of bipartisan majorities of the General Assembly and Pennsylvania voters.

As a follow-up to our (attached) January 14th letter, we want to emphasize our shared concerns with organized labor and business leaders, as well as, those raised by electricity consumers. We also want to emphasize that none of the issues raised in our previous letter, let alone the concerns raised in the February 16, 2021 IRRC comment letter, were properly addressed in the amendments or responses from the Department of Environmental Protection's (DEP) Environmental Quality Board (EQB).

Notwithstanding the modest changes from the proposed RGGI regulation, our substantial policy concerns remain with the final regulation:

- RGGI will trigger the near immediate closure of every coal and many natural gas plants throughout the Commonwealth, which will fundamentally restructure electric generation in Pennsylvania.
- RGGI will lead to the immediate loss of thousands of blue collar jobs, which will harm blue collar families and communities.
- RGGI will effectively prohibit the construction of any new natural gas plants in Pennsylvania, which will impact thousands of future jobs.
- RGGI will trigger significant rate increases for electricity customers, which will have a particularly harmful impact on low- and fixed-income households, who will not have access to direct bill subsidies as offered in most all RGGI states through this regulation.
- RGGI will effectively subsidize coal and natural gas plants in non-RGGI states, like Ohio and West Virginia, which will undermine virtually all of the alleged climate and environmental benefits cited by RGGI proponents.

 Because Pennsylvania operates within the PJM regional transmission organization, which is charged within ensuring adequate electricity is available throughout the region, and as confirmed by the most recent DEP modeling, virtually all of the Pennsylvania CO2 reductions will be offset by CO2 increases within non-RGGI PJM states.

We are also deeply concerned about the legal and constitutional issues as it impacts the General Assembly. In fact, many of the policy changes cited above are directly relevant to the legal shortcomings of the RGGI regulation. As IRRC noted in its comments, "this regulation falls within the scope" of the Regulatory Review Act's criterion that RGGI "represents a policy decision of such a substantial nature that it requires legislative review." We can think of no Pennsylvania regulation that would have so profound an impact, which has relied on so little statutory authority. If Pennsylvania is to join RGGI, this is a decision that must be made by the duly elected members of the General Assembly.

DEP argues that Section 5(a) of the Air Pollution Control Act (APCA), which was enacted in 1972, provides the legal basis for implementing the RGGI regulation. We find that difficult to accept. As the **INDEPENDENT** Regulatory Reform Commission, we trust you will come to a similar conclusion. DEP's attempt to bootstrap various definitions within the APCA to make its argument, along with its effort to cite various legal cases that effectively undermine its legal case, should be enough for IRRC to reject this regulation.

We accept the unfortunate reality that, under the Regulatory Review Act, DEP can disregard IRRC's rejection and move forward with the regulation regardless. In fact, in light of DEP's disregard for IRRC's recommendation that it "consider delaying the implementation of the rulemaking for one year" to "allow the regulated community an opportunity to adjust their business plans to account for the potential increased costs associated with Pennsylvania joining RGGI," there is a very real possibility that DEP will do just that. However, we believe IRRC can send a powerful, independent message to the General Assembly and our constituents that if, in fact, DEP intends to move forward, it will do so without IRRC's blessing, just is it proposes to do without the blessing of the General Assembly.

Regards,

Jim Struzzi, Representative 62nd Legislative District

Ham Snipder

Pam Snyder, Representative 50th Legislative District

Bryan Cutler, Representative 100th Legislative District

Herlander G

Donna Oberlander, Representative 63rd Legislative District

Stan Saylor, Representative 94th Legislative District

Mat Pauses

Martin Causer, Representative 67th Legislative District

Junh T

Frank Burns, Representative 72nd Legislative District

himde Schifel alver

Linda Schlegel Culver, Representative 108th Legislative District

Russ Diamond, Representative 102nd Legislative District

George Dunbar, Representative 56th Legislative District

Kur onlanen

Kurt Masser, Representative 107th Legislative District

Mike Armanini, Representative 75th Legislative District

Ø

Jim Cox, Representative 129th Legislative District

Sherye M. Beloquer

Sheryl Delozier, Representative 88th Legislative District

(-

Torren Ecker, Representative 193rd Legislative District

Au d. lond

Ann Flood, Representative 138th Legislative District

Rasbara Alcim

Barbara Gleim, Representative 199th Legislative District

Joseph Hamm, Representative 84th Legislative District

ogle M. Hiffley

Doyle Heffley, Representative 122nd Legislative District

Dant X. Hike nell

David Hickernell, Representative 98th Legislative District

R. Lee James, Representative 64th Legislative District

Tonathan A Fritz

Jonathan Fritz, Representative 111th Legislative District

Keith J. Dreine

Keith Greiner, Representative 43rd Legislative District

atrick J. Harhina

Patrick Harkins, Representative 1st Legislative District

usan C. H

Susan Helm, Representative 104th Legislative District

ild A. In

Rich Irvin, Representative 81st Legislative District

Mike Jones, Representative 93rd Legislative District

Ban J. Josuik

Barry Jozwiak, Representative 5th Legislative District

for Kenin

Joe Kerwin, Representative 125th Legislative District

Carrie Lewis Del Rosso

Carrie Lewis DelRosso, Representative 33rd Legislative District

Ryan Mackenzie, Representative 134th Legislative District

fin Markell

Jim Marshall, Representative 14th Legislative District

Carl Metzgar, Representative 69th Legislative District

1/1/

Joshua Kail, Representative 15th Legislative District

Kato A. Klunk

Kate Klunk, Representative 169th Legislative District

V. milon mackinge

Milou Mackenzie, Representative 131st Legislative District

in

Abby Major, Representative 60th Legislative District

Kob Mecui

Robert Mercuri, Representative 28th Legislative District

ikalek

Natalie Mihalek, Representative 40th Legislative District

Bitt R. Miller

Brett Miller, Representative 41st Legislative District

Marci Mustelle

Marci Mustello, Representative 11th Legislative District

Clinton Owlett, Representative 68th Legislative District

Tina Pickett, Representative 110th Legislative District

Rathy J. Kap

Kathy Rapp, Representative 65th Legislative District

Brad Prac

Brad Roae, Representative 6th Legislative District

Man

Dan Moul, Representative 91st Legislative District

Eric Nelson, Representative 57th Legislative District

& Kennyeuch Irac

Tracy Pennycuick, Representative 147th Legislative District

 \mathbf{Q}

Jack Rader, Representative 176th Legislative District

Jim Rigby, Representative 71st Legislative District

Kothman

Greg Rothman, Representative 87th Legislative District

nuch

Francis X. Payan

David Rowe, Representative 85th Legislative District

Spineto

Chris Sainato, Representative 9th Legislative District

Louis Schmitt, Representative 79th Legislative District

Curtis Sonney, Representative 4th Legislative District

Ryan Warner, Representative 52nd Legislative District

Dave Zimmerman, Representative 99th Legislative District

Francis Ryan, Representative 101st Legislative District

huk Song

Tommy Sankey 73rd Legislative District

Brian Smith

Brian Smith, Representative 66th Legislative District

Eng A. Stanlaugh

Perry Stambaugh, Representative 86th Legislative District

Thing Jarke h

Parke Wentling, Representative 17th Legislative District