

House of Representatives commonwealth of pennsylvania harrisburg

August 26, 2021

Pennsylvania Independent Regulatory Review Commission 333 Market Street 14th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101



AUG 27 2021

Independent Regulatory Review Commission

**Dear Commissioners:** 

We, the undersigned members of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, urge the Independent Regulatory Review Commission (IRRC) to disapprove final Environmental Quality Board (EQB) Regulation #7-559 (IRRC #3274), which would merge Pennsylvania into the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) over the objections of bipartisan majorities of the General Assembly and Pennsylvania voters.

As a follow-up to our (attached) January 14th letter, we want to emphasize our shared concerns with organized labor and business leaders, as well as, those raised by electricity consumers. We also want to emphasize that none of the issues raised in our previous letter, let alone the concerns raised in the February 16, 2021 IRRC comment letter, were properly addressed in the amendments or responses from the Department of Environmental Protection's (DEP) Environmental Quality Board (EQB).

Notwithstanding the modest changes from the proposed RGGI regulation, our substantial policy concerns remain with the final regulation:

- RGGI will trigger the near immediate closure of every coal and many natural gas plants throughout the Commonwealth, which will fundamentally restructure electric generation in Pennsylvania.
- RGGI will lead to the immediate loss of thousands of blue collar jobs, which will harm blue collar families and communities.
- RGGI will effectively prohibit the construction of any new natural gas plants in Pennsylvania, which will impact thousands of future jobs.
- RGGI will trigger significant rate increases for electricity customers, which will have a particularly harmful impact on low- and fixed-income households, who will not have access to direct bill subsidies as offered in most all RGGI states through this regulation.
- RGGI will effectively subsidize coal and natural gas plants in non-RGGI states, like Ohio and West Virginia, which will undermine virtually all of the alleged climate and environmental benefits cited by RGGI proponents.

 Because Pennsylvania operates within the PJM regional transmission organization, which is charged within ensuring adequate electricity is available throughout the region, and as confirmed by the most recent DEP modeling, virtually all of the Pennsylvania CO2 reductions will be offset by CO2 increases within non-RGGI PJM states.

We are also deeply concerned about the legal and constitutional issues as it impacts the General Assembly. In fact, many of the policy changes cited above are directly relevant to the legal shortcomings of the RGGI regulation. As IRRC noted in its comments, "this regulation falls within the scope" of the Regulatory Review Act's criterion that RGGI "represents a policy decision of such a substantial nature that it requires legislative review." We can think of no Pennsylvania regulation that would have so profound an impact, which has relied on so little statutory authority. If Pennsylvania is to join RGGI, this is a decision that must be made by the duly elected members of the General Assembly.

DEP argues that Section 5(a) of the Air Pollution Control Act (APCA), which was enacted in 1972, provides the legal basis for implementing the RGGI regulation. We find that difficult to accept. As the **INDEPENDENT** Regulatory Reform Commission, we trust you will come to a similar conclusion. DEP's attempt to bootstrap various definitions within the APCA to make its argument, along with its effort to cite various legal cases that effectively undermine its legal case, should be enough for IRRC to reject this regulation.

We accept the unfortunate reality that, under the Regulatory Review Act, DEP can disregard IRRC's rejection and move forward with the regulation regardless. In fact, in light of DEP's disregard for IRRC's recommendation that it "consider delaying the implementation of the rulemaking for one year" to "allow the regulated community an opportunity to adjust their business plans to account for the potential increased costs associated with Pennsylvania joining RGGI," there is a very real possibility that DEP will do just that. However, we believe IRRC can send a powerful, independent message to the General Assembly and our constituents that if, in fact, DEP intends to move forward, it will do so without IRRC's blessing, just is it proposes to do without the blessing of the General Assembly.

Regards,

Jim Struzzi, Representative 62<sup>nd</sup> Legislative District

Ham Snipder

Pam Snyder, Representative 50<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Bryan Cutler, Representative 100<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Herlander G

Donna Oberlander, Representative 63<sup>rd</sup> Legislative District

Stan Saylor, Representative 94<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Mat Pauses

Martin Causer, Representative 67<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Junh T

Frank Burns, Representative 72<sup>nd</sup> Legislative District

himde Schifel alver

Linda Schlegel Culver, Representative 108<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Russ Diamond, Representative 102<sup>nd</sup> Legislative District

George Dunbar, Representative 56<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Kur onlanen

Kurt Masser, Representative 107<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Mike Armanini, Representative 75<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Ø

Jim Cox, Representative 129<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Sherye M. Beloquer

Sheryl Delozier, Representative 88<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

(-

Torren Ecker, Representative 193<sup>rd</sup> Legislative District

Au d. lond

Ann Flood, Representative 138<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Rasbara Alcim

Barbara Gleim, Representative 199<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Joseph Hamm, Representative 84<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

ogle M. Hiffley

Doyle Heffley, Representative 122<sup>nd</sup> Legislative District

Dant X. Hike nell

David Hickernell, Representative 98<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

R. Lee James, Representative 64<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Tonathan A Fritz

Jonathan Fritz, Representative 111<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Keith J. Dreine

Keith Greiner, Representative 43<sup>rd</sup> Legislative District

atrick J. Harhina

Patrick Harkins, Representative 1<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

usan C. H

Susan Helm, Representative 104<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

ild A. In

Rich Irvin, Representative 81<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

Mike Jones, Representative 93<sup>rd</sup> Legislative District

Ban J. Josuik

Barry Jozwiak, Representative 5<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

for Kenin

Joe Kerwin, Representative 125<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Carrie Lewis Del Rosso

Carrie Lewis DelRosso, Representative 33<sup>rd</sup> Legislative District

Ryan Mackenzie, Representative 134<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

fin Markell

Jim Marshall, Representative 14<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Carl Metzgar, Representative 69<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

1/1/

Joshua Kail, Representative 15<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Kato A. Klunk

Kate Klunk, Representative 169<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

V. milon mackinge

Milou Mackenzie, Representative 131<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

in

Abby Major, Representative 60<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Kob Mecui

Robert Mercuri, Representative 28<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

ikalek

Natalie Mihalek, Representative 40<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Bitt R. Miller

Brett Miller, Representative 41<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

Marci Mustelle

Marci Mustello, Representative 11<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Clinton Owlett, Representative 68<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Tina Pickett, Representative 110<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Rathy J. Kap

Kathy Rapp, Representative 65<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Brad Prac

Brad Roae, Representative 6<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Man

Dan Moul, Representative 91<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

Eric Nelson, Representative 57<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

& Kennyeuch Irac

Tracy Pennycuick, Representative 147<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

 $\mathbf{Q}$ 

Jack Rader, Representative 176<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Jim Rigby, Representative 71<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

Kothman

Greg Rothman, Representative 87<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

nuch

Francis X. Payan

David Rowe, Representative 85<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Spineto

Chris Sainato, Representative 9<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Louis Schmitt, Representative 79<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Curtis Sonney, Representative 4<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Ryan Warner, Representative 52<sup>nd</sup> Legislative District

Dave Zimmerman, Representative 99<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Francis Ryan, Representative 101<sup>st</sup> Legislative District

huk Song

Tommy Sankey 73<sup>rd</sup> Legislative District

Brian Smith

Brian Smith, Representative 66<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Eng A. Stanlaugh

Perry Stambaugh, Representative 86<sup>th</sup> Legislative District

Thing Jarke h

Parke Wentling, Representative 17<sup>th</sup> Legislative District